Background

Sign Language Pronouns

There is an on-going debate about the nature of pronouns in signed languages, with several competing schools of thought:

- Sign languages have lexical pronouns (Petitto 1987, Sandler & Lillo-Martin 2006)
- Sign languages use pointing rather than pronouns (Friedman 1975, Evans & Levinson 2009)
- Sign language pronouns share qualities with both pointing and spoken language pronouns (Cormier et al. 2013)

However, most scholars agree that pronouns in signed languages share a phonological form with pointing gestures. This study offers evidence of a measurable difference in production between pronouns and pointing, which suggests that sign languages treat pronouns and pointing differently.

Lateralization

Linguistic behavior is strongly associated with lateralization, or preference for one side of the body—usually the dominant side. This is especially true for signed languages, which surfaces in a number of ways:

- Hand preference during signing is more lateralized than during manual tasks or gesture (Bonvillian and Richards 1993)
- The non-dominant hand in signing is phonologically restricted (Battison 1978, Brentari 1998)
- Use of the non-dominant hand is cross-linguistically marked (Tatman 2014)

Non-linguistic gestures, on the other hand, are generally less lateralized. Pointing, especially, is influenced by other factors, such as proximity (Lecontre and Fagard 2006, Gardiner et al., 2006) or cultural taboos (Kita & Essegbey 2001).

Hypothesis

Previous work shows that gestures and signs differ in their degree of lateralization. We can use this to determine whether sign language pronouns pattern with pointing gestures.

H0: Hand choice lateralization is the same for pronouns and other pointing gestures.

H1: Pronouns are more lateralized than pointing gestures.

Methods for NGT

Data

Hand choice data for the Sign Language of the Netherlands (NGT) was taken from the Corpus-NGT (Crasborn & Swertslooef 2008). Elan annotation files from the corpus are publicly available on-line (http://www.ru.nl/corpusngtenu).

Analysis

- Annotations were extracted from the Elan files using the pypmi Python module (Lubber 2014)
- Other analysis done in R (Core team 2013)

Results for NGT

- Density curves of proportion of use of the right hand. Produced using the sm.density.compare function from the sm package (Bowman & Azzalini 2014)

- While there was an overall preference for the dominant hand, it was stronger for pronouns than pointing, X^2 (1, N=2,234,915) = 47,780, p < .001

Possible Confounds

- The Corpus-NGT only contains information on 1st person pronouns. 3rd person pronouns may also behave differently.
- Video data is not yet available, so it was not possible to visually verify the findings (and the size of the data set would render that impractical).
- Lateralization of pronouns may be a language-specific effect.

Results for ASL

- As in NGT, there was an overall preference for the dominant hand, but it interacted with the type of sign:
  - 1st person pronouns showed a greater preference for the dominant hand than pointing, X^2 (1, N=934) = 103.86, p < 0.001
  - 3rd person pronouns were also more lateralized than pointing, X^2 (1, N=732) = 38.02, p < 0.001
  - 1st person pronouns were more lateralized than third-person pronouns X^2 (1, N=1174) = 12.771, p = 0.001

Possible Confounds

- The Corpus-ASL only contains information on 1st person pronouns. 3rd person pronouns may also behave differently.
- Video data is not yet available, so it was not possible to visually verify the findings (and the size of the data set would render that impractical).
- Lateralization of pronouns may be a language-specific effect.

Methods for ASL

Data

American Sign Language (ASL) data was taken from the National Center for Sign Language and Gesture (NC-SLGR) Corpus (Nidelde & Vogler 2012). Annotations and video files are available for use and download from http://www.bu.edu/asllrp/ and http://secrets.rutgers.edu/dsl/query/Pages/

Analysis

- Counts of locational indexing (IX-Loc), third person pronouns (IX-3p) and 1st person pronouns (IX-1p) produced with both the dominant and non-dominant hand extracted from web interface.
- Proportion of use of dominant hand calculated using:
  - Number produced with right hand / total produced
  - Tokens also examined visually
- Statistical analysis in R (Core team 2013)
  - 1420 tokens included

Results for ASL

- For both ASL and NGT, pronouns are more lateralized than pointing signs.
  - Pronoun production is reliably different from pointing (though it is gradient rather than categorical)
  - Given the body of work tying linguistic behavior to lateralization, this suggests that pronouns are “more language-y” than pointing
  - The differences between the 1st and 3rd person pronouns, however, suggest additional complexity

Future work:

- Expanding study to other, unrelated languages; NGT and ASL are genetically related, though French Sign Language (LSF)
- Investigating the difference between 1st and 3rd person pronouns
- Experimental verification of corpus results (behavioral or brain imaging studies)

Conclusion

Future work:

- Expanding study to other, unrelated languages; NGT and ASL are genetically related, though French Sign Language (LSF)
- Investigating the difference between 1st and 3rd person pronouns
- Experimental verification of corpus results (behavioral or brain imaging studies)

References


Work Supported by NSF Grant DGE-1256082. I would also like to extend my thanks to Luma Roselle and Eve Sweetser.